



# FORDHAM UNIVERSITY

THE JESUIT UNIVERSITY OF NEW YORK

## Faculty Senate

Joseph M. McShane, S.J., Hon. President	Dana Alonzo	Stephen Grimm	Jacqueline Reich
Eve Keller, President	Fran Blumberg	David Hamlin	Diane Rodriguez
Berish Rubin, Vice President	Melkana Brakalova-Trevithick	Ralf Hepp	Barry Rosenfeld
Patrick Hornbeck, Secretary	James Cohen	Winnie Kung	Berish Rubin
	Jeffrey Colon	Mark Mattson	John Seitz
	Marcia Flicker	Patricio Meneses	Falguni Sen
	Christopher GoGwilt	Haim Mozes	Grace M. Vernon
		Francesca Parmeggiani	Sarah Zimmerman

**Present:** Senate President Keller; Senators Alonzo, Blumberg, Brakalova-Trevithick, Colon, Flicker, GoGwilt, Grimm, Hepp, Hornbeck, Kung, Mattson, Meneses, Mozes, Parmeggiani, Rubin, Sen, Vernon, Zimmerman

**Excused:** Senators Cohen, Reich, Rodriguez, Rosenfeld, Seitz

**Invited Guests:** Jonathan M. Crystal, Interim Provost; Su-je Cho, Associate Professor of Curriculum and Teaching, Graduate School of Education; Jordan Devylder, Associate Professor, Graduate School of Social Service; Hooman Estelami, Professor of Marketing, Gabelli School of Business; Ronald Jacobson, Associate Vice President for Academic Affairs; Steven D'Agustino, Director of Online Learning, Office of the Provost

### *Call to Order*

Senate President Eve Keller called the meeting to order at 11:32 a.m.

### *Invocation*

Senator Zimmerman delivered the invocation.

### *Presentation from the President*

Joseph M. McShane, S.J., addressed the Senate, commenting on the following topics:

- *Puerto Rico Partnerships:* Fr. McShane recently visited Puerto Rico to meet with alumni/ae and pursue partnerships with institutions there, including Sacred Heart University and the Colegio San Ignacio, to support the island's ongoing recovery. He attended a performance of *Hamilton* starring Lin-Manuel Miranda, whose spouse is teaching this semester in the Fashion Law Institute in the Law School.
- *Provost Search:* Dennis Jacobs, presently provost at Santa Clara University, will begin service as provost at Fordham on July 1. He will be visiting campus this coming week, as well as monthly throughout the spring semester. During his upcoming visits he hopes to meet with deans, department chairs, and faculty leaders in the Senate. Jonathan Crystal has been named to the new position of vice provost. Searches for provost have failed at several institutions that share features with Fordham, including Loyola University Chicago, St. John's University, and Gonzaga University.
- *Jesuit Sexual Abuse:* Nine members of the Society of Jesus who were associated with Fordham appeared on the list of Jesuits credibly accused of sexual abuse of minors that was released by the

Northeast Province. Of these nine Jesuits, a substantial majority were affiliated with Fordham in only a limited way. Expressing both anger and shame that Jesuits committed such acts, Fr. McShane reported that the Board of Trustees has formed an independent advisory group to review and manage claims of abuse. He said that the University's concern is compassion and healing for the victims. The university's workplace conduct committee will review Fordham's standards of conduct to ensure our policies cohere with our mission.

Answering questions from Senators, Fr. McShane said that the University's response is not limited to the abuse of minors, and that there must be a broader conversation concerning cases involving vulnerable adults (a group in which he included undergraduate students, graduate students, and junior faculty). It was noted that only recently did the University update its policy concerning consensual relationships between faculty and undergraduate students, replacing strong discouragement of such relationships with outright prohibition. The workplace conduct committee is aiming to develop clearer policies and procedures for cases where inappropriate conduct does not rise to the level of a Title IX violation or statutory sanction. Fr. McShane asked for the moral support and leadership of the faculty as the University continues to respond to this serious matter.

### ***Presentation from the Interim Provost***

Dr. Jonathan Crystal addressed the Senate. He reported on the following matters:

- *Complaints against Faculty*: Returning to a question posed by a Senator at the December meeting, Dr. Crystal indicated that the Provost's Office, the Title IX coordinator, and Human Resources have clarified what kinds of complaints against faculty are handled in each of these venues. Complaints received anywhere will be directed to those responsible.
- *Continuous University Strategic Planning*: Dr. Crystal provided an update on the CUSP process, which will be the subject of an upcoming presentation to the Senate. He said that the inclusion this year of the provost a co-chair of the CUSP Committee acknowledges the relationship between Fordham's strategy and its academic mission. This year, the CUSP Committee will be focusing on developing specific initiatives to advance the priorities in the University Strategic Framework. The committee plans to engage the entire University community in its deliberations. Dr. Crystal noted that discussions within CUSP are intersecting with conversations within the Provost's Office about such matters as how to institutionalize and organize university-level support for teaching.
- *Reimagining Arts and Sciences*: Dr. Crystal indicated that he would soon be releasing his response to the report on Reimagining the Structure and Function of Arts and Sciences at Fordham. His response strongly endorses and supports the vision of that report.
- *Acting Associate Vice President*: Dr. Crystal announced the appointment of James P. McCartin, Associate Professor of Theology, as Acting Associate Vice President for Academic Affairs for the spring semester.

Dr. Crystal responded to questions about promotion procedures for clinical instructional staff, the impact of the workplace conduct initiative on academic freedom, and the need to ensure due process in any new policies concerning conduct and civility.

### ***Discussion on Student Journalist Agreement***

Senate President Keller introduced the next agenda item, a follow-up discussion from the presentation from two student journalists that the Senate heard at its December meeting. She drew Senators' attention to three documents: the agreement between the Senate and student journalists currently in place, proposed amendments to that document submitted by the student journalists, and a second set of amendments offered by a Senator. She summarized briefly the history of interaction between the Senate

and student journalists with regard to the presence of the latter at Senate meetings.

In the ensuing discussion, Senators raised the following points. There is a fear that Senators may not be able to speak freely if meetings are recorded and student journalists are allowed to attribute comments to specific individuals. Were this to be the case, the Senate would likely go into executive session with great frequency, which might hamper its ability to communicate with faculty colleagues through meeting summaries and minutes. The Senate has had a tradition of not recording meetings. Guests of the Senate might likewise feel constrained by the presence of journalists and recording devices. The change to the Senate's agreement with journalists that the Senate approved in September, which among other things changed the verb "fact-check" to "vet," may have overstated the Senate's intentions. (A copy of the agreement is available upon request from the office of the Faculty Senate.)

Senator GoGwilt, seconded by Senator Vernon, introduced a motion:

***Given the deliberations and work of the previous Senate to produce the current document, the Senate resolves to keep this current document in place, reverting the verb back to "fact-check" from "vet"; and the Senate resolves to hold this policy in place until the end of academic year 2019-2020, at the end of which the Senate would encourage the Senate then in place to review the policy.***

The question was called, and the motion carried, 18-0-0.

***Key Conversation: Online/Hybrid Learning across Fordham***

Senate President Keller introduced this meeting's key conversation. She thanked Senator Sen for coordinating the discussion and arranging for the presence of a number of guests: Ronald Jacobson, Associate Vice President for Academic Affairs, Office of the Provost; Steven D'Agustino, Director of Online Learning, Office of the Provost; Hooman Estelami, Professor of Marketing, Gabelli School of Business; Jordan Devylder, Associate Professor, Graduate School of Social Service; and Su-je Cho, Associate Professor of Curriculum and Teaching, Graduate School of Education. In addition, Senator Colon participated in the discussion as a faculty member in the School of Law.

Senate President Keller indicated that the goal of the discussion is to promote dialogue among faculty and administrators from various parts of the University. In addition, she said that the discussion should prepare the Senate for a proposal that would be voted upon at its February meeting, concerning language to be added to the University Statutes to recognize permanently and provide a charge for the recently created Online and Hybrid Learning Committee.

Points that emerged in the speakers' presentations included:

- *Gabelli School of Business*: The School has a dedicated IT support team and webcasting facilities. Approximately two dozen courses are being taught online by approximately a dozen faculty members. Three online master's programs are about to be launched. There are technological challenges to be addressed, particularly with regard to synchronous teaching. It would be beneficial if faculty could receive some sort of certification for online teaching. There needs to be an understanding that online and hybrid teaching is a long-term investment; it should be seen as such by the faculty and administration.
- *Office of the Provost*: Fordham's efforts in the area of online and hybrid education date back to 1999. Last semester, 1,900 students took at least one online/hybrid course, comprising some 12.5% of the total student population. Six schools are involved at both the graduate and undergraduate levels. There is a Teaching and Learning Online Group that provides support for faculty. Fordham's work in the area of online and hybrid education comes against the backdrop of

the overall virtualization as well as hybridization of many aspects of university life, including both teaching (e.g., most courses have some online component, even if simply directing students to view a website) and student services (e.g., Fordham's partner, 2U, is facilitating students' access to mental health providers). Ongoing challenges concern developing the correct structures and the appropriate balance for strategically allocating resources to online learning at both the university and school levels.

- *Graduate School of Social Service*: There has been much change in GSS regarding online and hybrid programs, and faculty have different points of view. Many faculty have found 2U responsive to their requests, but there have been disagreements about what 2U considers to be best practices and about what falls into the category of curriculum, where faculty have discretion. The experiences of individual faculty who have worked with 2U, however, have been very positive. Issues that remain include uncertainty around pathways for communication: whom should faculty members call with what questions? There are also certain technical limitations to the 2U platform itself.
- *School of Law*: 2U was recently chosen as the Law School's partner, and the School's first online program will be a Master of Science in Law in Compliance. The administrator managing online learning has recently departed, but the transition to an interim leader has been relatively painless. 2U staff have been very competent, offering good feedback even when they are not knowledgeable about a particular content area. That said, there is uncertainty about how 2U comes to designate something a "best practice," and 2U sometimes appears to be inflexible. It would be helpful for faculty teaching online for the first time to see good examples of various teaching modalities. Faculty in the Law School are concerned about offering the J.D. online, viewing it as a possible dilution of Fordham's strong "brand" in legal education.
- *Graduate School of Education*: GSE has recently suffered in enrollments, and at present, there are more students in online than on-ground programs. Faculty have found it difficult to make changes to their online courses after the initial stage of development. They have found 2U staff to be very professional and helpful, although faculty have reported frustration at having to work with different 2U colleagues on different matters.

In subsequent discussion, Senators raised the following points. There is confusion about the respective roles of 2U staff, academic administrators at Fordham, and faculty. Some faculty have requested to form committees that would interact directly with 2U representatives. 2U's invocation of "best practices" is not always clear: sometimes it appears that a "best practice" is what 2U did at other institutions. There may be a need for conducting and communicating to faculty additional research on online teaching and learning. Some faculty believe that deans feel pressured to deliver programs that have strong revenue implications, and this can lead junior faculty who specialize in relevant areas to feel pressured to spend time developing online courses rather than conducting research that might count more toward tenure and promotion. The Senate should discuss how to protect junior faculty in such a position.

Senate President Keller summarized the conversation by stating that it should be an ongoing goal to optimize Fordham's efforts in the area of online and hybrid education. This conversation has been good for a variety of reasons, not least because it has laid groundwork for the Senate's upcoming discussion of the proposed statutory charge for the Online and Hybrid Learning Committee. She thanked Senator Mozes and Dr. Crystal for their collaborative work on that document.

### ***Announcements and Updates***

Senate President Keller reported on a variety of matters, including:

- *Senate Committees*: The Tenure and Reappointment Appeals Committee and the Faculty Hearing Committee have requested and have now received permission from the Executive Committee to

interview colleagues via videoconference. Senate President Keller stressed that this permission is not for the committees' deliberations, but rather for the convenience of those being asked to testify before the committees. Committee members must continue to be present in person in a single location. The Senate may wish at a future meeting to address the question of videoconferenced meetings in general.

- *Board of Trustees:* Faculty representatives to the committees of the Board of Trustees, along with the members of the Senate Executive Committee, have been invited to a lunch with trustees that will take place during the Board's meeting on February 6. Senate President Keller has been invited to participate in the meeting of the Board Strategy Committee. There is mutual interest in developing relationships between members of the Board and the Senate.
- *Upcoming Meetings:* Senate President Keller previewed the topics of the key conversations at upcoming meetings of the Senate, including strategic planning in February, faculty compensation in March, and the library and faculty workload in April.

### ***Approval of Minutes***

The Senate approved the minutes of the meeting of December 7, 2018 (16-0-0).

By acclamation, the Senate adjourned at 2:35 p.m.

Respectfully submitted by J. Patrick Hornbeck II, Secretary