HYPOTHETICAL VIGNETTES

Christine D. Cea, Ph.D.
Celia B. Fisher, Ph.D.

Center for Ethics Education
Fordham University
Vignette 1: Protocol for Assessment of Consent Capacity - Treatment
Psychopharmacological Treatment for Aggressive Behavior

Understanding factual information

Tom has a problem. He gets mad, shouts and starts fights at the place where he works. Tom has tried to control his behavior and has asked people at work for help, but he cannot stop these behaviors. If he does not stop these behaviors, he will not be allowed to come to work.

**Question 1. Nature of disorder:** Something is wrong with Tom's behavior at work. What is wrong with Tom's behavior?

Tom goes to see a psychiatrist. A psychiatrist is a doctor that can help people with their behavior.

**Question 2. Role of practitioner:** Tom goes to a psychiatrist. What is a psychiatrist?

The psychiatrist tells Tom that he could take medicine that might help him stop these behaviors. The medicine is called Sentaril. Tom would take 2 pills, one in the morning and one at night for many weeks.

**Question 3. Nature of treatment:** What can the psychiatrist do to help Tom with his problem?

The psychiatrist says that the good thing about taking the medicine is that it can help Tom by keeping him calm. He won’t feel like shouting or starting fights as much as he does now and he will be allowed to come to work.

**Question 4. Treatment benefits:** What are the good things that could happen if Tom takes the medicine?

The psychiatrist tells Tom that the bad thing about taking the medicine is that it might make Tom feel a little sick. He might feel dizzy or sleepy and his mouth might feel very dry.

**Question 5. Treatment risks:** What are some of the bad things that might happen if Tom takes the medicine?

The psychiatrist tells Tom that if he does not take the medicine, he will not feel sick, he will not get dizzy or sleepy, and he will not have a dry mouth.

**Question 6. Refusal benefits:** What is the good thing that would happen if Tom does not take the medicine?

The psychiatrist also says that the bad thing about not taking the medicine is that Tom will still get mad, shout and fight, he will have to work even harder to control his behavior, and he may not be allowed to come to work anymore.

**Question 7. Refusal risks:** What are the bad things about not taking the medicine?
Appreciation of situation and consequences

The psychiatrist tells Tom that he has a choice - he can say "yes" he wants to take the medicine or he can say "no" he does not want to take the medicine.

Question 8. Voluntary nature of treatment: What choices does Tom have? If participant gives just one choice, say "Tom has 2 choices, what are the 2 choices?"

Question 9: Appreciation of disorder: Why does the psychiatrist say that Tom should take medicine?

Question 10. Consequences of accepting treatment: Why would Tom want to take this medicine?

Question 11. Consequence of refusing treatment: Why would Tom not want to take the medicine?

Rational manipulation of relevant information

Question 12. Considering both risks and benefits: What should Tom think about before he makes a choice about whether or not to take the medicine?

Question 13. Weighing risks and benefits:
(a) There are good and bad things about taking the medicine and not taking the medicine. What are the most important things for Tom think about before deciding whether or not to take the medicine?

(b) What things are not so important for Tom to think about before deciding whether or not to take the medicine?

Communicating a choice

Question 14. Communicating a decision to accept or refuse treatment: What do you think Tom should do? Should he tell the psychiatrist "yes" he wants to take the medicine or "no" he does not want to take the medicine? Why?
**Vignette 2:** Protocol for Assessment of Consent Capacity - Treatment  
**Dental Treatment for Braces**

**Understanding factual information**

Something is wrong with Louis' teeth. They are crooked and crowded together. This makes them look funny. They are also hard to clean.  
**Question 1. Nature of the disorder:** Something is wrong with Louis' teeth. What is wrong with Louis' teeth?

Louis goes to the dentist. A dentist is a doctor that fixes people's teeth.  
**Question 2. Role of practitioner:** Louis goes to the dentist. What is a dentist?

The dentist says that he wants to fix Louis' teeth so that they are straight. To do this, Louis will have to wear braces. Braces are mental hooks that are glued to the top and bottom teeth. Then the dentist puts wires through the hooks. Louis will come to the dentist every month so that the wires can be made tighter and tighter until his teeth are straight. This should take about one year.  
**Question 3. Nature of treatment:** What can the dentist do to help Louis with his problem?

The dentist says that the good thing about getting braces is that when the braces are taken off after a year, Louis' teeth will look good and they will be straight and easy to clean.  
**Question 4. Treatment benefits:** What are the good things that can happen if Louis wears the braces?

The dentist says that the bad thing about getting braces is that in the beginning they might hurt. Louis' mouth might be sore and he will have to take extra care brushing his teeth to make sure that he cleans them between the hooks and the wires. Also, people will see the braces when he smiles.  
**Question 5. Treatment risks:** What are the bad things about wearing the braces?

The dentist tells Louis that if he does not wear the braces, his mouth will not hurt, he will not have to take extra care cleaning them, and people won't see the braces when he smiles.  
**Question 6. Refusal benefits:** What are the good things that would happen if Louis does not wear the braces?

The dentist also tells Louis that the bad thing about not getting the braces is that his teeth will stay crooked and crowded together, they will be hard to clean, and they will look funny.  
**Question 7. Refusal risks:** What are the bad things about not getting the braces?
Appreciation of situation and consequences

The dentist tells Louis that he has a choice -- he can say "yes" he wants to wear braces on his teeth or he can say "no" he doesn't want to wear braces on his teeth.

**Question 8. Voluntary nature of treatment:** What choices does Louis have? If participant gives just one choice, say "Louis has 2 choices, what are the 2 choices?"

**Question 9. Appreciation of disorder.** Why does the dentist say that Louis should wear braces?

**Question 10. Consequences of accepting treatment:** Why would Louis want to wear the braces?

**Question 11. Consequences of refusing treatment:** Why would Louis not want to wear the braces?

Rational manipulation of relevant information

**Question 12. Considering both risks and benefits:** What should Louis think about before he makes a choice about whether or not to wear the braces?

**Question 13. Weighing risks and benefits:**
(a) There are good and bad things about wearing the braces and not wearing the braces. What are the most important things for Louis to think about before deciding whether or not he should wear the braces?

(b) What things are not so important for Louis to think about before he decides whether or not to wear the braces?

Communicating a choice

**Question 14. Communicating a decision to accept or refuse treatment.** What do you think Louis should do? Should he tell the dentist "yes" he wants to wear the braces or "no" he does not want to wear the braces? Why?
Vignette 3: Protocol for Assessment of Consent Capacity - Treatment
Medical Treatment for Allergy

Understanding factual information

John is not feeling well. He has an allergy to dust, flowers and trees. He is sneezing and his eyes are itchy. He also has a runny nose and a headache. Sometimes John sneezes so much that he can't sleep at night.

**Question 1. Nature of disorder:** John is not feeling well. What is wrong with John?

John goes to an allergist. An allergist is doctor that helps people with allergies feel better.

**Question 2. Role of practitioner:** John goes and allergist. What is an allergist?

The doctor tells John that he wants to give him allergy shots. A shot is a needle with medicine in it that the doctor will give John in his arm. John will have to see the doctor for 6 weeks to get 6 shots.

**Question 3. Nature of treatment.** What can the doctor do to help John with his problem?

The doctor says that the good thing about getting the shots is that John will not have allergies. He will not sneeze, have itchy eyes, a runny nose, a headache, and he will be able to get some sleep.

**Question 4. Treatment benefits:** What are the good things that can happen if John gets the shots?

The doctor tells John that the bad thing about getting the shots is that they might hurt, like a pinch in his arm, and he might have a pain in his arm for a few days after each shot.

**Question 5. Treatment risks:** What are some of the bad things that might happen if John gets the shots?

The doctor tells John that if he does not get the shots, he will not feel a pinch in his arm and his arm will not hurt for a few days.

**Question 6. Refusal benefits:** What are the good things that would happen to John if he does not get the shots?

The doctor also says that the bad thing about not getting the shot is that John will sneeze, his eyes will be itchy, his nose will run, his head will ache, and he will not be able to sleep.

**Question 7: Refusal risks:** What are the bad things about not getting the shots?
Appreciation of situation and consequences

The doctor tells John that he has a choice -- he can say "yes" he wants to get the shots, or he can say "no" he does not want the shots.

**Question 8. Voluntary nature of treatment:** What choices does John have? If participant gives just one choice, say “John has 2 choices, what are the choices?”

**Question 9. Appreciation of disorder:** Why does the doctor say that John should take the shots?

**Question 10. Consequences of accepting treatment:** Why would John want to get the shots?

**Question 11. Consequences of refusing treatment:** Why would John not want to get the shots?

Rational manipulation of relevant information

**Question 12. Considering both risks and benefits:** What should John think about before he makes a choice about whether or not to get the shots?

**Question 13. Weighing risks and benefits:**
(a) There are good and bad things about getting the shots and not getting the shots. What are the most important things for John to think about before deciding whether or not to get the shots?

(b) What things are not so important for John to think about before deciding whether or not to get the shots?

Communicating a choice

**Question 14: Communicating a decision to accept or refuse treatment:** What do you think John should do? Should he tell the doctor "yes" he wants to get the shots or
"no" he does not want to get the shots? Why?